



Spiritual Leadership from the Perspective of Tri Hita Karana: A Systematic Literature Review

I Gusti Ayu Agung Dewi Kurnia Uthami ^{a*},
Wayan Gede Supartha ^a, I Gusti Ayu Manuati Dewi ^a
and Ida Bagus Ketut Surya ^a

^a Faculty of Economics and Business, Udayana University, Bali, Indonesia.

Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.9734/jesbs/2024/v37i61357>

Open Peer Review History:

This journal follows the Advanced Open Peer Review policy. Identity of the Reviewers, Editor(s) and additional Reviewers, peer review comments, different versions of the manuscript, comments of the editors, etc are available here:

<https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/128426>

Systematic Review Article

Received: 10/10/2024

Accepted: 12/12/2024

Published: 16/12/2024

ABSTRACT

Aims: Spiritual leadership is a research study that is proposed as an alternative medium for leading an organization where personal values and beliefs are the reference for organizational success.

Objective: To critically analyze the spiritual leadership of organizations from the perspective of the Tri Hita Karana philosophy in Bali and whether it is profit or non-profit. This study aims to examine scientific publications related to spiritual leadership from the tri Hita Karana philosophy originating from Bali by conducting a systematic review and discussing implications for further research.

Design/Methodology/Approach: The researcher used a literature review research method. This study uses a collection technique by exploring articles, books, journals, and other information relevant to the research topic. The literature will be reviewed systematically, focusing on three aspects. Among them are knowledge in the form of concepts, definitions and typologies (elements).

*Corresponding author: E-mail: agungdewikurnia12@gmail.com;

Findings: Show that the idea of religious management is empirically extra operationalized than Tri Hita Karana. The core of non-secular management is about the values embraced, attitudes and behaviors of leaders that intrinsically encourage their fans to have a experience of religious survival thru calling and club, while 'Tri Hita Karana' emphasizes the values of neighborhood cultural knowledge. cooperative teamwork, and a philosophy of living fortunately for the commonplace desirable.

Practical Implications: This study attempts to fill the gap in the literature on Spiritual Leadership from the Tri Hita Karana philosophy of life that can be contextualized.

Originality/Value: There is no literature that discusses how organizational spiritual leadership with the Tri Hita Karana philosophy in Bali. This study pioneers the exploration of spiritual leadership within the framework of Tri Hita Karana philosophy. Therefore, the author believes that this review is very useful for academics and practitioners to identify important research opportunities for the future.

Keywords: Spiritual leadership; Tri Hita Karana; systematic literature review.

1. INTRODUCTION

Working is our obligation to fulfill our daily needs. Like it or not, working has become a source of social contribution. most useful thing we can give to society. Although working is very important for economic well-being, working only to fulfill our obligations certainly cannot fulfill our needs as human beings. Today we spend too much time at work or in work-related social activities, so that we are not fully connected to family, friends, love and other aspects of life. As a result, there is a lot of pressure on us to be more sensitive to the inner aspects that must be channeled. If you want to make changes personally or in social aspects, it will most likely happen at work. Because after all, the life we have is about the spirit. Our role as humans, we only carry the spirit /soul that we have into a meaningful life.

In the 2000s, finally many literatures emerged that advocated a new era of the need for spiritual awareness. This phenomenon was revealed because many managements were found to be non-intuitive, relying only on rationality and more focused on material things, causing problems in many companies. To overcome this, the solution that can be offered is spirituality [1]. In one definition, it is stated that "Spirituality is a force that motivates life, an energy that inspires someone towards a certain goal or transcendent goal. In another definition, spirituality is the meaning, energy, purpose and awareness of life. These definitions mainly refer to the energy or power that inspires people towards a certain goal. This inspiring force gives meaning and purpose to their lives. According to this definition, the existence of spirituality in people's lives is a stimulant for survival [2]. Hawley [3] observed that the important relationship between

spirituality and leadership is: *"all leadership is spiritual because the leader seeks the best for society. And, the best is always associated with one's higher self."* This point of view shows that leadership is based on by individual spirituality through growing awareness of oneself and others. After reviewing 150 studies on the topic of leadership, Laura Reave (2005) found that:

...there's consistency regarding non secular values and practices and powerful management. Values lengthy been considered religious ideals, which includes honesty, integrity and humility, were shown to influence management success. In addition, conventional practices associated with spirituality along with in ordinary life have now been shown to be associated with leadership effectiveness. All of those practices have been emphasized in many spiritual teachings, and they're additionally very vital leadership talents: which includes displaying appreciate for others, being truthful, caring. listening responsively, acknowledging the contributions of others, and engaging in reflective practice [4].

Fry [5] suggests how to implement spiritual leadership practically, namely by having a vision, mission, strategy, goals and practices committed to creating alignment of values and vision at all levels of the organization, and being able to develop effective relationships within the organization and stakeholders involved. In this case, there are practices and implementations of spiritual leadership that need to be done. At the first, it is important to conduct periodic assessments of the spiritual leadership model to establish a baseline and identify areas that require transformation and organizational

development intervention. Second, conducting a stakeholder vision analysis is important to (1) establish and/or confirm the expectations, beliefs, vision, and cultural values associated with spiritual leadership, which will help identify key issues, and (2) provide a basis for communication throughout the organization regarding appropriate goals and strategies to address those issues.

Rafsanjani et al., [6] argues that non secular leadership is a process of influencing others thru the spiritual values of the leader, those religious values are someone's beliefs and ideals about the that means of life which include love, compassion, equality, and justice. Folks that use their non secular values to encourage and encourage their followers are known as spiritual leaders. religious leaders can be determined in diverse fields, consisting of enterprise, authorities, schooling, and non-earnings agencies. The sustainability and fulfillment of an organisation relies upon on the knowledge and alertness of leadership practices that recognize the religious needs of people, are inclusive, and may balance enterprise desires with the psychological properly-being of personnel [7].

Spiritual leadership, viewed through the lens of Tri Hita Karana, emphasizes a leadership approach grounded in high spiritual values and ethics, aiming to create harmony in three key relationships: between humans and God, among people, and with the environment. This foundation and spiritual guidance for leaders in their roles. In Bali, tourism is generally managed through cultural concepts, necessitating efforts to preserve and develop cultural assets as attractions [8]. Balinese culture, deeply rooted in Hindu values and the Tri Hita Karana philosophy, seeks balance and harmony among humans, God, and nature to promote wellbeing and happiness for all beings. Tri Hita Karana emphasizes the balance between Bhuana Agung (the Universe) and Bhuana Alit (humans), focusing on harmonious relationships. In the tourism sector, many businesses adopt these principles to balance economic gain, cultural preservation, and environmental sustainability.

While both Spiritual Leadership and Tri Hita Karana share common ethical and spiritual values, they differ in application and context. Tri Hita Karana is more local and collective, emphasizing broader relationships, whereas Spiritual Leadership tends to be universal, personal, and flexible. Modern challenges and

commercialization have created gaps in applying both concepts, particularly in balancing spiritual and material aspects. This research aims to conduct a systematic literature review titled. Through the presentation of the research background that has been described, the researcher is interested in conducting research with the title "**A Systematic Literature Review of Spiritual Leadership Within Tri Hita Karana Philosophies.**" This systematic literature review aims to provide a comprehensive overview of spiritual leadership research as seen within the Tri Hita Karana philosophy.

2. METHODOLOGY

A systematic literature review is a method that uses a structured process in detail to explore, evaluate, and draw conclusions from all literature from various sources related to a particular research topic in a relevant manner [9]. The purpose of applying this method is to present a comprehensive review of the research topic discussed against existing studies in the scientific literature on spiritual leadership from the perspective of the Tri Hita Karana philosophy. The need for an inclusive and integrated approach in analyzing Spiritual Leadership seen from the Tri Hita Karana philosophy because it was born from the need to see whether there are similarities between the concepts, definitions, and elements between the two.

A comprehensive and detailed literature search on Spiritual Leadership and Tri Hita Karana was performed using specific inclusion and exclusion criteria during the keyword title search in the Publish or Perish database and software. Publish or Perish is a tool that retrieves and analyzes academic citations from various sources, including Google Scholar, Microsoft Academic Search, Scopus, Web of Science, and Crossref. It provides metrics such as the total number of articles, journals, and publication rankings. Searches within Publish or Perish are restricted to Google Scholar and Crossref. Articles were selected based on their citation counts and rankings, as summarized in Table 1, which lists the top 10 articles ranked by citations from January 2000 to September 2024.

To achieve more specific objectives, several methods were employed, focusing on the use of keywords that must appear in the article titles: *Spiritual Leadership* and *Tri Hita Karana Philosophy*. Babbie and Mouton (2001:192) state

that only recognized and accepted articles in scientific research should be included when establishing a body of knowledge. Green and Adams ([10]:105) also emphasize the importance of searching reputable journals for current and credible literature on the topic. However, as shown in Table 1 (numbers 11-20), a search for articles specifically on Tri Hita Karana philosophy did not yield results in reputable journals via Publish or Perish. This indicates that a different strategy is necessary to find literature on Tri Hita Karana philosophy. Therefore, a manual search involving primary research reviews and unpublished blog content was implemented to enhance the 'breadth and depth of the search' [10], considering the unique aspects of the Tri Hita Karana concept. The search timeframe was set from January 2000 to September 2024 to ensure that critical literature was not overlooked.

For relevance purposes, abstracts of the searched literature were read to ensure that they best matched the search criteria. These articles had to have a methodology included to ensure that they were empirically grounded. However, since the subject of spirituality (specifically Balinese cultural spirituality) lacks empirical confirmation, articles that did not have a methodology were also considered to broaden the scope and breadth of the research.

2.1 Data Analysis

A literature review should summarize concisely from a set of relevant sources the most relevant collective conclusions. It should also evaluate the state of knowledge in terms of what is right, what is wrong, what areas of uncertainty or debate cannot be resolved using existing research, and what is missing because it has not been considered carefully [11].

The analysis of Spiritual Leadership seen from the Tri Hita Karana philosophy requires concepts, definitions and typologies (elements). This will be summarized below using an analysis method similar to that proposed by Babbie and Mouton (2011). Regarding the definition, there are limitations made based on the following criteria, only words that include 'definition', 'described as', 'meaning', 'seen as', 'seen as' and 'consists of' are used to obtain the meaning, definition of Spiritual Leadership and Tri Hita Karana. Typology (elements) is seen as a reference for grouping concepts that have the same characteristics while the reference to the scientific framework and hypothesis used to

explain the concept is recorded as a proven model and framework to underlie the strengths related to the theory [12].

2.2 Concept, Definition and Typology

In the following systematic literature review, the concepts of Spiritual Leadership and Tri Hita Karana will be presented. The focus is on the basic foundation of academic knowledge. The focus is on three things, namely concepts, definitions, and typologies. After introducing the concepts separately, these concepts will be compared critically. Mouton (1999) defines scientific concepts, definitions, empirical statements, typologies, models, theories and paradigms, as the foundation of science. The following will discuss Spiritual Leadership and the Philosophy of Tri Hita Karana.

2.2.1 Spiritual leadership

2.2.1.1 Concept

Spiritual Leadership is an approach to leadership that focuses on the spiritual values, ethics, and holistic well-being of individuals within an organization. Spiritual leaders prioritize balance between material and spiritual goals and encourage emotional and moral growth in their followers. Therefore, spiritual leaders who have an inner life or spiritual practice will be more likely to have, or want to develop, other values centered on altruistic love and vision. Transcendent to those with a primary interest in strengthening the hope/belief of doing "what it takes" to achieve the vision. To implement spiritual leadership, leaders through their attitudes and behaviors exemplify the values of altruistic love by co-developing a shared vision with their followers [13]. This helps create a positive and sustainable work environment, where employees feel connected to the organization's values and are encouraged to make their best contributions.

In an increasingly competitive and dynamic world, this approach allows organizations to remain relevant, innovative, and ethical. According to [14], spiritual leadership is a leadership style that brings the worldly dimension into the divine (spiritual) dimension. God is a true leader who guides the conscience of His people through an ethical approach and exemplary behavior in a wise manner. Therefore, spiritual leadership is also called leadership based on religious ethics. If leadership is an expression to

show who we are, then that means that all existing leadership is spiritual leadership. Spiritual leadership is about searching within our true self. Self-awareness and self-mastery are the beginning of the search for spiritual leadership, then develop into a person's core values that authentic, and culminating in leaving a legacy filled with purpose in life through selfless service for the greater good [15]. Through spiritual leadership, trust, and spirituality in the workplace, organizations can take responsibility for creating an environment committed to maximizing the triple bottom line [16].

2.2.1.2 Definition

There are various definitions of spiritual leadership. Here are the definitions of these authors:

- Fry [5] defines that "spiritual leadership is the values, attitudes and behaviors to motivate oneself and others intrinsically so that they have a sense of spiritual survival through membership and calling in the organization."
- Reave's (2005) perspective on Spiritual Leadership namely being able to be "treated more, as a phenomenon that occurs and can be observed when the individual occupies a leadership position that can realize spiritual values. These values consist of honesty, integrity, humility, a figure who can be trusted, admired and relied on "
- Chen & Chun I Li, [17] stated that Spiritual leadership has the aim of using strategies accompanied by individual and team empowerment, to build a concept regarding a vision that contains organizational values, so that this is able to improve organizational performance and commitment in the workplace.
- Jody Fry [13] stated that spiritual leadership is a way to influence members/employees intrinsically with belief /hope in the vision of service to key stakeholders and organizational culture which is based on altruistic love. Its purpose is to fulfill the basic needs of both the leader himself and his followers through calling and membership so as to create harmony of vision. at all levels of individuals, teams and organizations. Until finally it culminates as a driver of employee welfare levels, organizational commitment,

social responsibility and sustainability, and creating higher financial performance. All of that is able to meet the *triple bottom line aspect*.

- Samul [18] stated that spiritual leadership is a view because its leadership focuses on universal values such as honesty, integrity. love, compassion behavior that always feels grateful, the ability and attitude of a leader. Spiritual leaders become successful because they do not need to change their own identity or others, situations, and organizations. The quality of these spiritual values provides a way of thinking to seek higher awareness so as to create a conducive workplace that can maximize *the triple bottom line*.

The definition of Spiritual Leadership according to [16] is the emergence intrinsic motivation that contains values, behaviors and attitudes of both leaders and those they lead, spurs a sense of spiritual survival through calling (a strong drive for spirituality) and membership (connectedness). On the other hand, Reave's (2005) view of spiritual leadership is seen as an observable leadership event when leaders choose to embrace certain values. Chen & Chun I Li [17] further elaborate that the strategy of spiritual leadership is to meet the needs of employees. Their focus is on the behavior, attitudes and values of leaders that help shape and meet the needs of employees.

This view is also reinforced by [18] where the focus is on the spiritual values of organizational leaders which are seen as being able to be implemented into the organization so that they can create a conducive work environment, so that they can maximize the triple bottom line. Therefore, as emphasized by [16] that spiritual leadership has an effect on organizational leaders and employees to inspire each other to achieve spiritual survival through membership and calling. Most authors including important authors on Spiritual Leadership [1] favor the for-profit organization approach. Very few authors mention the non-profit approach. Although [19] do not favor the 'whole person' approach to spiritual leadership, they avoid religious elements as part of the 'whole person'. However, practitioners must prevent the negative impacts of spiritual leadership. For example, when organizational leaders apply a spirituality approach as a managerial tool to manipulate employee behavior and public perception in order to achieve profit (Crossman 2010:

Fornaciari and Dean 2001; Nicolae et al. 2017). As some researchers have found, spiritual leadership has potential risks due to its heavy emphasis on love and altruistic love. This can leave employees feeling overwhelmed and force them to make sacrifices at the expense of their personal time and energy [20]. There is a gap in the literature regarding the non-profit element of spiritual leadership in organizations. The idea of universal applicability is rejected, but the contextual approach is supported.

2.2.1.3 Element

According to [16] the cause-effect theory of spiritual leadership was refined with the existence of an intrinsic motivation model that combines vision, belief /hope, and altruistic love. In addition, there is a theory of spirituality in the workplace, and spiritual survival. The goal of spiritual leadership is to create a vision and alignment of vision and values across individual and team levels that ultimately drive organizational commitment and productivity to a higher level. Spiritual Leadership consists of six distinct parts:

1. The causal theory of spiritual leadership is seen from the values, behavior and attitudes of the leader (including vision, beliefs/hopes, and altruistic love) "affects the followers' need for survival their spirituality (through membership and calling)", ultimately resulting in organizational commitment and productivity.
2. This was developed in the theory of intrinsic motivation. The theory of intrinsic motivation is:
Basically defined as the interest and enjoyment of an activity from the activity itself which is associated with activeness in carrying out tasks that people find enjoyable and interesting. The result is to stimulate growth and fulfillment of needs to a higher level (p.699).
3. It combines three elements vision, belief/hope and altruistic love. These elements focus on the values that the leader embodies. Vision refers to the purpose or journey of the organization, belief /hope refers to resilience and perseverance, and altruistic love relates to virtues such as forgiveness, kindness, integrity, honesty and empathy.
4. This incorporates spirituality into the workplace. This is manifested in an

organization that recognizes "the inner/spiritual life of employees who carry out meaningful work in a community context." This definition includes three spiritual needs of employees, namely inner /spiritual life, meaningful work, and group/community. It also includes a 'whole person' approach [19].

5. This includes spiritual survival through membership and calling that focuses on followers. Calling (experience of transcendence or being called) and membership (social connection) are two aspects of spirituality in the workplace that constitute the 'dimension interrelated and essential for spiritual survival' [16].
6. This includes a leadership approach based on religion, ethics and the values of the leader. Inclusivity most of the ones mentioned come from Western religious theologians as stated by [16].

Analysis of spiritual leadership highlights its key components identified by Fry [16], particularly intrinsic motivation that stems from shared values, behaviors, and attitudes. This dual perspective-from both the leader and follower's perspective emphasizes the interdependence of their relationship to build a sense of spiritual continuity. However, your critique of the assumed homogeneity in the application of these principles is important. It suggests the need for a deeper understanding that recognizes the differences in cultures and traditions across regions. By acknowledging this variability, we can move beyond a Western-centric view that may overlook the rich diversity of spiritual leadership practices and perspectives across contexts.

Integrating these cultural dimensions into a spiritual leadership framework can enhance its relevance and effectiveness. ensuring that it is accessible to a wider audience and respects the unique values and beliefs of different communities. This approach not only enriches the theory but also promotes a more inclusive model of leadership that can adapt to global diversity.

2.2.2 The philosophy of Tri Hita Karana

2.2.2.1 Concept

The essence of Tri Hita Karana is a balanced life behavior between worshiping God, serving fellow human beings and developing a sense of love for nature and the environment. The concept of Tri

Hita Karana has inspired the lives of Balinese (Hindu) people. This makes Bali harmonious macrocosm and microcosm. In the book *Sarasamuscaya* it is stated that by striving for the welfare of all creatures in the world, it will guarantee the establishment of the Four Goals of Life (Catur Marga). In order to realize that, Tri Hita Karana must be carried out by humans, because only humans have a central function in practicing it. Humans must build themselves to become the main actors in realizing Sundaram. Sundaram is a philosophy of harmony that is described more conceptually so that it becomes Tri Hita Karana which is more actualized into the Hindu cultural system in Bali. Balinese Hindu culture is building harmonious and dynamic relationships based on *yadnya* between humans and God, humans and the environment including individual life, family life, work life, traditional village life, and even into global life [21].

Currently, the leader organizations in the VUCA era face various challenges and use of available resources. Normally, they definitely want to achieve holistic success. Thomas [22] stated that organizations need an environmental conservation strategy which describes various actions such as supporting ecological systems for the future and fighting against all forms of practices that endanger the earth. Therefore, the most expected business practices are businesses that are able to balance profits and continue to preserve the environment. This concept is called *tripke bottom line*. Thomas stated that organizations still do not realize that the success of a company is also a gift from God. If this is in Hindu leadership, the relationship with the Creator (God) must be done. Three causes of happiness are stated in Tri Hita Karana namely: (1) a harmonious relationship between humans and God (*prahyangan*); (2) a harmonious relationship between humans and humans (*pawongan*); and (3) harmonious relationship between humans and the environment [22].

Implementation of Tri Hita Karana must be supported by various creative cultural approaches to be able to be applied by the wider community. From a humanist perspective, many leaders/entrepreneurs view that workers whose status is not in the managerial ranks will be of low social value. But in the Tri Hita Karana philosophy leaders /entrepreneurs must respect the rights of all human beings, be pioneers in creating fair and equal relationships, and not exploit fellow human beings and be aware of the

interdependence between living things and society [23].

Ngurah, A. A., & Sadiartha, G. [24]. The Tri Hita Karana program in Bali has been developed since 2000, the name of the program is Awards and Accreditations (abbreviated as the THK Award program) which is carried out in hotels in Bali. This aims to encourage hotel management to implement THK in managing their hotels. If the hotel is able to implement THK optimally, It is expected that there will be no conflict in the hotel environment. Gorda in [25] stated that the Tri Hita Karana (THK) concept can be a scientific reference for leaders because it can provide the following understanding:

- The concept of Tri Hita Karana can be understood from various fields, both in terms of business, politics and social aspects, which are able to increase individual and organizational productivity, synergy from the aspect of God Almighty (Brahman, Parahyangan), human resources (Praja, Pawongan) and natural resources (Kamaduk, Pabelasan).
- Tri Hita Karana can be understood as a concept of organizational behavior. Organizational behavior consists of individual behavior, human behavior in organizations and group behavior.
- Conditions of an institution or organization in its rational operation.

The concept of Tri Hita Karana of course it can be applied universally because every organizational leader in the world certainly hopes for harmony and balance in all aspects of life so that the organization they manage can be sustainable [22].

2.2.2.2 Definition

Here are some definitions of Tri Hita Karana.

Sudiartha [8] stated that the term Tri Hita Karana first appeared at the time of the Regional Conference of the Balinese Hindu Struggle Body at the Dwijendra Denpasar College on November 11, 1966. The conference was held based on the awareness of Hindus to play a role in practicing their dharma in order to achieve a prosperous, just and prosperous society according to Pancasila. Gradually, Tri Hita Karana continued to expand and develop. Tri Hita Karana means three causes of well-being/happiness (Tri = three, Hita = prosperous, Karana = cause) which

originate from the harmony of the relationship between humans and their God, humans and their natural environment, humans and each other. The elements of Tri Hita Karana include: 1) Sanghyang Jagatkarana; 2) Bhuana; 3. Humans. The elements of Tri Hita Karana are found in the holy book Bhāgawad Gita (11.10), which has the following contents:

*Sahayajnah prajah srista pura waca
prajapatih anena prasawisya dhiwan esa
wo'stiwistah kamadhuk*

It means:

In ancient times, Prajapati created humans with yadnya and then said: "With this you will develop and will become the fulfiller of the desires of all beings (kamadhuk)."

Bhagavad Gita verse above shows three elements that are interdependent. Namely: Prajapati = God Almighty, Praja = Human, where the application of Tri Hita Karana in the lives of Hindus in Bali is described in three aspects:

1. The relationship between humans and the Almighty God (parhyangan) is manifested in the God Yadnya.
2. The relationship between humans and their fellow humans (pawongan) is manifested through Pitra, Rsi, and Manusa Yadnya.
3. The relationship between humans and their natural environment (palemahan) which is manifested through Bhuta yadnya.

According to [24], Tri Hita Karana is a life philosophy embraced by the Balinese that fosters harmony in existence. This harmony exists between humans and Ida Sang Hyang Widhi Wasa (Parhyangan), which is the first component of Tri Hita Karana. It is this harmony that cultivates peace, allowing for balance in both the visible (sekala) and invisible (niskala) realms. Sekala represents the material aspects of life, while niskala pertains to the spiritual dimensions. The aim is to achieve a balance between these two forms of life so that the ultimate goal of life in Hinduism 'Mokshartam Jagathita ya ca iti Dharma' can be realized. To attain happiness in accordance with the Tri Hita Karana concept, individuals must connect with God/Ida Sang Hyang Widhi Wasa through religious practices within their communities. Nadra et al., [26] further emphasized that Tri Hita Karana represents an effort to establish three harmonious relationships

based on the four life goals known as Catur Purusa Artha [27]. **Catur Purusa Artha** are four life goals in Hindu teachings that provide guidance on the balance between spirituality and worldliness. The following is an explanation of the four goals:

- **Dharma:** Moral and ethical obligations and right actions in accordance with cosmic laws and spiritual values. It refers to living a life of virtue and responsibility.
- **Artha:** The pursuit of material well-being and wealth. Artha includes efforts to legitimately satisfy physical and economic needs, and to create prosperity in line with the principles of dharma
- **Kama:** Fulfillment of desires and sensual pleasures, including love, pleasure, and worldly desires. However, kama must be practiced in balance with Dharma and Artha.
- **Moksha:** Spiritual liberation or enlightenment, that is, freedom from the cycle of rebirth (samsara) and union with the Divine. Moksha is the highest goal in life according to Hindu teachings.

Catur Purusa Artha teaches balance between material fulfillment, sensual happiness, moral responsibility, and spirituality. We cannot describe Spiritual leadership in Bali without discussing the Balinese-centered approach itself. The Balinese-centered approach is essentially Socio-Cultural. Tri Hita Karana as 'the consciousness, quality of thought, mode of analysis, and actionable perspective by which the Balinese people seek to re-affirm the subject's place in the context of Balinese history and the formation of the culture itself'. A leader who applies the principles of dharma and Tri Hita Karana will always strive to achieve balance in spiritual, social, and environmental aspects. For example, in the context of modern such as hotel or tourism management in Bali, a leader who uses the Tri Hita Karana philosophy will protect the environment (palemahan) by implementing environmentally friendly practices, building good relationships with employees and the community (pawongan), and respecting spiritual values (parahyangan) through local religious rituals or activities. This philosophy is very relevant in creating leaders who care about sustainability, social justice, and spirituality.

2.2.2.3 Element

Adhitama, [28] stated that Tri Hita Karana has three elements of harmony in life.

- The first element is called Parahyangan, which addresses the relationship between humans and the Creator/God. This aspect highlights the presence of the "I," representing the "Substance" or "energy" that originates from God. God is not distant from His creations, as He resides within the "I." This element stems from the "CONSCIOUSNESS" that God is All-Powerful, and His authority is truly limitless.
- The second element is known as Pawongan. This aspect emphasizes the importance of balance within social life. Once individuals recognize that their "I" comes from God, it is only natural for them to behave and act as good and moral beings, aligning with what it means to be "human"- creatures capable of controlling negative desires. Simply put, if one does not wish to be harmed, they should not inflict pain on other creations of God.
- The third element is referred to as Palemahan. This element describes the harmonious relationship between humans and nature. Essentially, humans are part of the natural world, and thus they should feel empathy towards it. The relationship between nature and humans is very close and interconnected. When nature is disturbed or "sick," such as during disasters, human life becomes affected. Conversely, humans also impact nature; for instance, if they care for or harm the environment, nature will respond accordingly. This wisdom leads to the understanding of how we, as humans, should appreciate and care for nature. The natural world and its inhabitants exist for the common good, and true happiness comes from enjoying it together. To prevent potential conflicts, there must be guidance to ensure our lives involve mutual respect, compassion, and stewardship.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The concepts, definitions and typologies (elements) mentioned in the literature review above are used to analyze the relationship between Spiritual Leadership and Tri Hita Karana. The purpose of the study as mentioned above is to critically analyze the literature on Spiritual Leadership from the perspective of Tri Hita Karana. The methodology chosen for this analysis is a systematic literature review, and

then further analyzing the findings based on scientific foundations (definitions, concepts, and typologies). The reason why Tri Hita Karana is used is to provide a more holistic approach in understanding spiritual leadership in both profit and non-profit organizations.

3.1 Results by Concept

Fry, [16] defines spiritual leadership as a collection of values, behaviors and attitudes, who are intrinsically able to motivate themselves and others so that they have a sense of spiritual survival through membership and calling. Meanwhile, Rafsanjani et al., [6] argues that spiritual leadership is leadership that can bring the material dimension that is worldly into the spiritual dimension. Indeed, God is a true leader who is capable of influencing, serving and moving the conscience of His servants through a very wise way accompanied by an ethical approach and exemplary behavior. In fact, spiritual leaders are able to make people love their jobs and then motivate them in their organizational tasks, thus ensuring their spiritual survival [2].

On the other hand, there is the Tri Hita Karana Concept as a Balinese philosophy of life in order to be able to realize a happy life by building a harmonious relationship with God (Parhyangan), humans (Pawongan) and the environment (Palemahan). As seen in Table 1, most of the literature on Spiritual Leadership (I-10) that meets criterion only looks at one dimension. namely the profit dimension. This bias supports one worldview (Western) that is based on individualism. In contrast. Tri Hita Karana seeks to eliminate this error by bringing a concept that attempts to state that locality culture, traditionalism, and the Balinese indigenous knowledge system play an important role in shaping employee values, behaviors, and attitudes in the workplace. They look at the material aspects and most importantly the non-material aspects of Spiritual Leadership as presented in Table 1.

While there are some overlaps in the analysis of these two constructs, they remain distinct. For example, the concept of spiritually guided leadership within spiritual leadership may resonate with Tri Hita Karana, yet the key difference lies in their foundational worldviews. Spiritually guided leadership is rooted in a Western perspective that primarily emphasizes the material aspects of spirituality, highlighting transcendence independently of

Table 1. Summary of articles that meet the criteria: Spiritual leadership and Tri Hita Karana philosophy

No.	Writer	Year	Topics	Journal	Citation	Ranking	Method	Paradigm	Profit/Non Profit
1.	Louis W. (Jody) Fry	2003	Towards a Spiritual Leadership Theory in the future	The Leadership Quarterly Elsevier	4951	8	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit
2.	Reaves, L.	2005	Spiritual values related to leadership effectiveness	The Leadership Quarterly	1600	1	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit
3.	Louis W. (Jody) Fry	2008	Development of Spiritual Leadership Theory in the future	Spirituality in Business Springer	293	1	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit
4.	Louis W. (Jody) Fry	2013	Development of Spiritual Leadership Theory with the awareness of the emergence of corporate focus on <i>the Triple Bottom Line</i> and spirituality in the workplace	Information Age Publishing	10	5	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit
5.	Chin-Yi Chen and Chun-I Li	2012	The Impact of Spiritual Leadership on Organizational Citizenship Behavior: A Multi-Sample Analysis	Journal of Business Ethics, Springer	457	2	Quantitative	Positivism	Profit
6.	Chin-Yi Chen and Chun-I Li	2013	Assessing the effectiveness of Spiritual Leadership	The Leadership Quarterly	246	1	Quantitative	Positivism	Profit
7.	Satinder Dhiman	2017	How to become a superior and serving Spiritual leader	Holistic Leadership: A New Leadership Paradigm Springer	4	48	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit
8.	Mariana Nicolae, Irina Ion, and Elena Nicolae	2017	Spiritual Leadership: Implications for Managerial Action	Business Ethics and Leadership from Eastern Europe Springer	4	2	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit
9.	Joana Samul	2019	Spiritual Leadership: Sustainable Meaning in the Workplace	MDPI Journal Sustainability	159	36	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit
10.	Jihye Oh & Jia Wang	2020	Spiritual leadership: current status and agenda for future research and practice	Journal of Management, Spirituality & Religion	138	1	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit
11.	I Made Purana	2016	Implementation of Tri Hita Karana in the Life of Hindus	Journal of Educational Studies Widya Accarya FKIP Dwijendra University	-	-	Qualitative	Interpretive	Profit and Non Profit
12.	Anak Agung Ngurah Gede Sadiartha	2017	Representation of Hindu Leadership in LPD Organizational Culture	World Wide Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Development.	-	-	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit

No.	Writer	Year	Topics	Journal	Citation	Ranking	Method	Paradigm	Profit/Non Profit
13.	Cory	2020	Tri Hita Karana Philosophy as a Foundation for Harmonization and a Happy Life	Sruti: Journal of Hinduism	-	-	Qualitative	Interpretive	Non-Profit
14.	The Great Knight	2020	The Concept of Tri Hita Karana in the Teachings of Cultivation Beliefs	Journal of Religious and Cultural Sciences	-	-	Qualitative	Interpretive	Non-Profit
15.	I Made Suasti Puja and I Gede Aryana Mahayasa	2021	The Relevance of Hindu Leadership in Organizations in the Millennial Era	Management Widya	-	-	Qualitative	Interpretive	Profit and Non Profit
16.	I Wayan Sudiarta	2021	The Concept of Tri Hita Karana in the Implementation of Hindu Cultural Tourism	Scientific Journal of Hindu Cultural Tourism	-	-	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit and Non Profit
17.	I Nyoman Nadra	2022	Hindu Leadership in Building the Whole Human Being	Kamaya: Journal of Religious Studies	-	-	Qualitative	Positivism	Profit and Non Profit

any religious context. In contrast, Tri Hita Karana integrates religious beliefs as a fundamental aspect of Balinese identity, viewing them as an inherent motivation for transcendence. This distinction underscores how each framework approaches spirituality and leadership from different cultural and philosophical angles.

3.2 Results by Definition

This definition of religious management is juxtaposed with Tri Hita Karana which looks at material and non-material methods. Non-material methods refer to Tri Hita Karana which includes the structure of understanding religion and customs. Scholars such as [1] and Reave (2005) tend to look at the non-material dimension of spiritual leadership. In their definition of spiritual leadership, they state that a non-material approach to spiritual leadership will bring chaos in the workplace where each worker will try and bring their own religion. They assert that a non-material approach to spiritual leadership is just an attempt to sell da'wah in the office thus ignoring this dimension. However, Tri Hita Karana supports the non-material dimension and does not try to sell individualism but teamwork and communalism, which are the rules of the original Balinese way of life. As explained, the definition of spiritual leadership tries and standardizes the group. In this way, they reject cultural differences and local realities. The aim is to preserve the hegemony of colonial management. Balinese management philosophy, on the other hand, is a contextual approach to management. It embraces cultural and conventional diversity and makes it a strong pressure for leadership. The philosophical definition of Tri Hita Karana is seen in the way of doing things, which helps the concept of decolonization of management that allows employees to be 'whole human' in a business place where they are free to practice a number of traditional practices today, not seen as proselytism. However, care must be taken in this effort to avoid the same appeal of essentialization that is accused of Tri Hita Karana in the definition of spiritual leadership. As seen in Table 1, many spiritual management authors write about its definition, concept, notes, and elements. Non-material measurements are basically not recorded. Which includes religion, customs, lifestyle, and local values that influence the leader himself.

On the other hand, Tri Hita Karana is a construction that tries, although incompletely, to

contextualize spiritual management in the Balinese context. Seen from the above understanding, this collection pays particular attention to local realities, customs, religions, and cultures that then shape the values, behaviors, and attitudes of leaders. Although this creation has not yet developed into a complete principle, this idea lays the foundations of the concept, which in a certain way becomes the basis for the development of constructions that take into account local realities. So far, Tri Hita Karana appears to be the main stepping stone towards the contextualization of the principles of religious leadership and the development of the principles of religious management in Bali as a group.

3.3 Results by Typology (Elements)

The factors of spiritual management study the values, attitudes and behaviors of leaders that form and instill a experience of spiritual survival in followers through club and calling. Fry [16] as seen above has identified six factors that make up the principle of religious leadership. In assessment, there are three factors of Tri Hita Karana where those elements are formed from Balinese religion, customs and nearby lifestyle itself.

The elements of Tri Hita Karana are very open and interpretable, making it difficult to make comparisons with the elements of spiritual management. This is another gap inside the Tri Hita Karana literature where in there are not any evolved, clear and concise factors that fit the theoretical framework. Consequently, there is a want to expand these elements. The three factors identified by using [21,24,28]: Sudiarta (2021): Nadra [26] which contains about harmonious relationships with nature, fellow humans, and the environment can in all likelihood be linked to [16] element, specifically vision, hope or notion and altruistic love. The vision and notion issue the inner lifestyles of the leader himself that's associated with the spirit that comes from God. Altruistic love is the manifestation of factors of harmonious relationships with nature and the surroundings. The difference is, Fry [16] really states that this is a focus on leadership and no longer a focus on fans. In contrast. Purana [21,24,28]: Sudiarta (2021): Nadra [26] have not mentioned the focal point of these elements. This hole isn't always intentional, however definitely because Tri Hita Karana has not evolved sufficient right into a theory that can live on empirical and educational.

The concept of religious leadership as emphasized by Fry [5] also has an element of spirituality in the work environment. This element is specifically aimed at followers and looks at the spiritual needs of followers (internal lifestyle, important work, and community). Tri Hita Karana does not specifically look at these elements but rather emphasizes the aspects of teamwork and networking as defined by Nadra [26]. Community and cooperation consisting of ritual implementation and mutual cooperation are very important in daily interactions. However, the concept of spiritual management does not guide networking in the work environment. In Bali, and networking are key aspects as evidenced by the life of the pakraman village/traditional village which makes it important in daily interactions for organizations established in the village environment.

The 3 factors of Tri Hita Karana are pretty convincing in the present day assessment. these factors offer the idea for the formulation of Balinese spirituality, for leaders and within the place of work. Balinese humans view lifestyles as a generic go with the flow. because of this Balinese leaders are privy to their region within the in no way-finishing cycle whilst helping others (their followers) to pick out with their place. This is an element exemplified in Balinese Hindu subculture and religion and taught to kids as they grow up. Symbiotically linked to this detail is the Tri Hita Karana idea that humans have a cosmic dating with nature and ancestors. That is in truth linked to the Panca Sradha which states that believe inside the existence of atman or ancestral spirits [29]. As expressed, the primary feature of leadership is to establish symbiosis with the community, nature, and the environment. For this reason, a moral order is created inside the place of job that is not characterised by means of technical talents, but by means of the application of the philosophy of common friendship that is what Balinese spirituality.

In conclusion, the current literature on Spiritual Leadership does not support a non-secular approach. Most scholars tend to avoid the subject of religion in the workplace even though according to [19] employees are encouraged to bring their wholeness to work. The disagreement between spirituality and religion poses a problem for authors in the 'whole person' approach which creates a gap in the literature due to the lack of research supporting the 'whole person' approach which assumes that an individual's spirituality as

shaped by culture, religion, and tradition is certainly important.

3.4 Results for Research Paradigm

As seen in Table 1, most Spiritual Leadership experts tend to adopt a positivist philosophy.

However, Forniciari and Lund Dean (2001) have warned that this approach is not sufficient 'but may actually be detrimental to the discipline by inauthentically measuring and analysing important variables such as spirit, soul, faith, God and the cosmos' (Lund Dean, Forniciari & McGee 2003). In Table 1, qualitative and quantitative techniques are used in understanding Spiritual Leadership; however, [30] states that a growing number of scholars see the weaknesses of quantitative approaches. For example, Forniciari and Lund Dean (2001) challenge researchers to consider 'evidence about the phenomenon of spirituality that operates from non-positivist ways of knowing'. Alternatively, they suggest 'ethnomethodological techniques, qualitative techniques and traditional story-based methods, as more appropriate research methods than positivist methods' [30]. Qualitative researchers can begin by using their own lived reflections on socio-historical context. This type of approach does not focus narrowly on specific questions, but reflects on theories philosophical paradigm in a curious and open solution (Choy, 2014). These alternatives are more attractive for a new paradigm to study spiritual leadership in Bali.

4. CONCLUSION

A leader is an individual who possesses leadership qualities that can influence the attitudes and behaviors of others or the surrounding community. Leaders need strategies to motivate employees so that the organization's goals can be achieved. Every leader has a different leadership style in each organization. One of the styles that can be applied is spiritual leadership. The Theory of Spiritual Leadership generally assumes that the workplace prioritizes material aspects over spiritual ones. This approach is homogeneous and universal, thus neglecting local realities, history, traditions, and culture. Therefore, this approach is not relevant to be applied in the Bali region, Indonesia. In this context, Tri Hits Karans is considered a more suitable alternative.

Tri Hita Karana emphasizes the values of humanity, community, cooperation, as well as

tradition and culture. However, as explained, Tri Hita Karana has not yet developed sufficiently to become a comprehensive alternative theory for Spiritual Leadership. A systematic review of the existing literature shows a gap, where many Western academics focus more on material aspects and neglect the spiritual dimension. Thus, Tri Hita Karana is considered a bridge that combines both aspects. Given that Tri Hita Karana has not yet been fully developed into a theory, it is recommended to create an integrated and contextual Tri Hita Karana approach that encompasses local realities, traditions, religions, history, and culture. These findings have practical implications that can be used by human resource practitioners and academics for further human resource development and training. The spiritual aspect is indeed as important as the material aspect.

5. RESEARCH LIMITATIONS

This study has limitations. The methodology used only limits the search to published articles on the philosophy of Tri Hita Karana life in Bali. Only the Publish or Perish system is used to search for literature. In addition, the literature does not discuss national variations if Tri Hita Karana is also applied in several regions in Indonesia. This may be another perspective for future research on Spiritual Leadership within the scope of Tri Hita Karana in Bali

DISCLAIMER (ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE)

Author(s) hereby declare that NO generative AI technologies such as Large Language Models (ChatGPT, COPILOT, etc) and text-to-image generators have been used during writing or editing of this manuscript.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. Fairholm GW. Spiritual leadership: fulfilling whole-self needs at work. *Organ Dev J*. 1996;17(5):11-17.
2. Javanmard H. The impact of spirituality on work performance. *Indian J Sci Technol*. 2012;5(1). Available: <http://www.indjst.org/IndianJ.Sci.Technol>
3. Hawley J. Reawakening the spirit at work: The power of Dharmic management. 1993.
4. Dhiman S. Spiritual leadership: A superior way to be and serve. In: *Holistic Leadership*. Palgrave Macmillan US. 2017; 155-179. Available: https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-55571-7_7
5. Fry LW. *Spiritual leadership: State-of-the-art and future directions for theory, research, and practice*; 2008.
6. Rafsanjani H, Banking DP, Faculty S, Islam A. *Spiritual leadership*. Masharif Al-Syariah J Isl Econ Bank; 2017.
7. Murtafiah. Implementation of organizational theory based on Islamic spiritual values in educational practice. *J Educ*. 2023;5(4):11012-11020.
8. Sudiarta IW. The concept of Tri Hita Karana in the implementation of Hindu cultural tourism; 2021.
9. Nurahma G. Systematic review of case studies in qualitative research. *Mediapsi*. 2021;7(2):119-129.
10. Green J, Adam A. Writing narrative literature reviews for peer-reviewed journals: Secrets of the trade. *J Chiropr Med*. 2006;5(3):102-117.
11. Knopf JW. Doing a literature review. Available: www.apsanet.org
12. Sibanda K, Grobler A. A systematic literature review of spiritual leadership within African management philosophies. *Acta Commercii*. 2024;24(1). Available: <https://doi.org/10.4102/ac.v24i1.1164>
13. Fry JW. Spiritual leadership and faith and spirituality in the workplace. In: *Handbook of Faith and Spirituality in the Workplace: Emerging Research and Practice*. Springer New York. 2013;697-704. Available: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4614-5233-1_38
14. Alimuddin. Spiritual leadership. *Isl Educ Manag*. 2019;4:159-170.
15. Dhiman S. Leadership and spirituality. In: *Leadership and Spirituality*. Springer International. 2017;139-160. Available: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-31036-7_8
16. Fry LW. Toward a theory of spiritual leadership. *Leadersh Q*. 2003;14(6):693-727. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.leaqua.2003.09.001>

17. Chen CY, Li CI. The impact of spiritual leadership on organizational citizenship behavior: A multi-sample analysis. *J Bus Ethics*. 2012;107:107-114.
18. Samul J. Spiritual leadership: Meaning in the sustainable workplace. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*. 2020;12(1):267. Available: <https://doi.org/10.3390/su12010267>
19. Mitroff I, Denton E. A study of spirituality in the workplace. *Sloan Manag Rev*. 1999;40(4):83-92.
20. Oh J, Wang J. Spiritual leadership: Current status and agenda for future research and practice. *J Manag Spiritual Relig*. 2020;17(3):223-248. Available: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14766086.2020.1728568>
21. Purana IM. Implementation of Tri Hita Karana in the life of Hindus. *Widya Accarya J Educ Stud*. 2016.
22. Puja IMS, Mahayasa IGA. The relevance of Hindu leadership in organizations in the millennium era. *Widya Manajemen*. 2021;3(2):186-203. Available: <https://doi.org/10.32795/widyamanajemen.v3i2>
23. Ramatha IW. Critical analysis of Balinese economy. *Account Manag Dev*. Denpasar: Udayana University; 2017.
24. Ngurah AA, Sadiartha G. The representation of Hindu leadership in the culture of LPD organization. *WWJMRD*. 2017;3(7):114-119. Available: www.wwjmr.com
25. Windia. Business analysis based on Tri Hita Karana. Denpasar: Udayana University Press; 2011.
26. Nadra IN, Bagus G, Denpasar S. Hindu leadership in building a whole person. *J Relig Sci*. 2022;5. Available: <https://jayapanguspress.penerbit.org/index.php/kamaya>
27. Wiana I. Tri Hita Karana according to Hindu concepts. *Paramita*; 2007.
28. Adhitama S. The concept of Tri Hita Karana in the teachings of Budi Daya beliefs. *Dharmasmrti*. 2020;29-45.
29. Mahendra PRA. Proceedings of Sigma Pancasila: Experiencing diversity strengthens Indonesianness. *Pancasila Ideology Development Agency*; 2020.
30. Benefiel M. The second half of the journey: Spiritual leadership for organizational transformation. *Leadersh Q*. 2005;16(5):723-747.

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of the publisher and/or the editor(s). This publisher and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.

© Copyright (2024): Author(s). The licensee is the journal publisher. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history:

The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
<https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/128426>